

Revitalizing Old Banten: Evidence on Effectiveness and Policy Outcomes

Ramadhaningsih^{ID}, Titi Stiawati^{ID}

Public Administration Study Program, Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, University Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa

Corresponding Author Email: ramadhaningsih00@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Received : January 7, 2026
Revised : February 28, 2026
Accepted : March 30, 2026

Keywords:

Effectiveness, Revitalization, Banten Lama Area, Policy Outcomes

The revitalization of the Banten Lama area was implemented to address the physical degradation of the historic area, limited infrastructure, and irregular socio economic activities that could potentially reduce the area's function as a religious and cultural tourism destination. However, after implementation, various problems still emerged, such as the arrangement of vendors the suboptimal utilization of supporting facilities, and the lack of integrated institutional coordination. This study aims to analyze the effectiveness of the revitalization of the Banten Lama area after its implementation. This study uses a descriptive qualitative approach. The research subjects were 17 informants selected purposively sampling, consisting of elements of the provincial and city governments, area managers, Kenadziran, Task Force, vendors and tourists. Data were collected through semi-structured interviews, field observations, and documentation studies. Data analysis was conducted with reference to Nakamura and Smallwood's theory of policy effectiveness, which includes five indicators: achievement of program objectives, efficiency, target group satisfaction, client responsiveness, and maintenance systems. The results of the study indicate that the revitalization is effective in improving the physical and aesthetic quality of the core area and increasing the number of tourist visits. However, effectiveness is not evenly distributed in the socio economic aspects, utilization of supporting facilities, inter agency coordination, and the maintenance system, which is still sectoral. This study concludes that the revitalization of the Banten Lama area has demonstrated effectiveness in terms of physical aspects and increased tourist appeal, but this effectiveness is not yet comprehensive.

INTRODUCTION

Banten Province, located on the western tip of Java, played a crucial role in the history of Islam's development in the Indonesian archipelago. Since the time of the Banten Sultanate, the region has been known as a center for the spread of Islam, intellectual activity and international trade. Traces of this glory can still be found in the numerous historical relics scattered throughout Banten, making it a prime destination for religious and historical tourism in Indonesia.

One of the most important historical areas in Banten Province is the Banten Lama Area located in Serang City. This area was the center of the Banten Sultanate's glory and is home to numerous historical sites, including the Grand Mosque of Banten, Surosowan Palace, Kaibon Palace, Speelwijk Fortress, Tasikardi Lake, Pecinan Tinggi Mosque, Karangantu Harbor, and the Sultanate's tombs. The presence of these sites makes the Banten Lama Area a strategic location for historical preservation and the development of religious cultural tourism.

During its heyday, the Banten Sultanate played a crucial role in politics, economics, and the spread of Islam in the Indonesian archipelago. Under the leadership of Sultan Ageng Tirtayasa, Banten developed into a cosmopolitan center of trade and shipping, as well as a meeting place for diverse cultures and intellectuals. This is reflected in the diverse architectural heritage, spatial planning, and resource management systems that can still be seen today.



Picture 1. Zoning map of cultural heritage areas in the Banten Lama area.

Over time the physical condition and management of the Banten Lama area have declined. Several historical sites are poorly maintained, accessibility is inadequate and tourist facilities are very limited. Before the revitalization, the area faced various problems, such as damaged roads, inadequate parking, a lack of public facilities, and disorganized commercial activities. These conditions reduced visitor comfort and threatened the preservation of the area's historical value. In addition to the physical challenges, the poorly managed activities of street vendors and beggars around the Grand Mosque of Banten create chaos and disrupt the area's function as a center of worship and pilgrimage. Conflicting

interests between the preservation of the area and the economic needs of the local community present challenges in managing the Banten Lama area.

In response to these challenges, the Banten Provincial Government and the Serang City Government implemented a revitalization program for the Banten Lama area, which began in 2018. This program aims to improve infrastructure, preserve cultural heritage sites, enhance tourism support facilities, and organize community activities in the area. This revitalization is also expected to improve visitor comfort and encourage sustainable tourism growth.

The revitalization process has demonstrated significant physical changes, such as road improvements, redevelopment of core areas, park construction, provision of public facilities, and increased tourist visits. Data on tourist visits indicates significant changes following the revitalization, despite a decline during the COVID-19 pandemic. The following table shows the development of tourist visits to the Banten Lama area from 2017 to 2024.

Table 1. Recapitulation of the Number of Tourist Visits in the Banten Lama Area of Serang City

Year	Foreign Tourist	Domestic Tourist	Total
2017		563.373	563.373
2018		1.570.640	1.570.640
2019		10.205.634	10.205.634
2020		10.991.123	10.991.123
2021		1.966.236	1.966.236
2022		5.904.583	5.904.583
2023	18	7.509.543	7.509.561
2024	19	7.811.429	7.811.488

Source: Serang City Tourism Office, 2025

Data shows that tourist arrivals increased from 563,373 in 2017 to 10,991,123 in 2020. In 2021, there was a significant decline to 1,966,236 due to the COVID-19 pandemic. However, visits increased again from 2022 to 2024, reaching 7,811,488 in the final year. This indicates that revitalization has contributed to increasing the area's attractiveness.

Initial observations indicate that the revitalization has not been fully successful. Several new issues have emerged, particularly in the area's vendor management. Vendor management still faces challenges in implementing the revitalization efforts. Although the government has relocated street vendors to kiosks in the Tourism Support Area, unlicensed hawkers continue to operate informally in the Banten Grand Mosque Plaza. They use simple equipment, such as plastic bags and food containers, without permanent stalls, creating disorder in an area that should be free from commercial activity. This situation indicates that the vendor management policy has not been fully effective in maintaining order in public spaces and supporting the sustainability of the revitalization efforts.

In addition to vendor restructuring, parking and supporting infrastructure are also challenges after the revitalization. Parking facilities at Sukadiri Terminal remain inadequate, with roads in poor condition and increasingly difficult to access during the rainy season. Interviews with management revealed that infrastructure at Sukadiri Terminal and the Tourism Support Area does not meet standards, particularly in terms of road pavement, public facilities, and security systems. This situation has the potential to reduce visitor comfort and satisfaction and impact the area's image.

In addition to limited facilities, illegal parking practices are also rampant, outside the supervision of the Serang City Government. Interviews with the Transportation Agency revealed that many vehicles are parked on land with unclear ownership status, such as private yards and vacant lots, thus excluding the official parking system as stipulated in Regional Regulation No. 2 of 2019 concerning Regional Levies. This situation creates tariff uncertainty for visitors, has the potential to reduce Regional Original Income (PAD), and damage the image of the revitalized tourist area.

Field observations indicate that development of the Tourism Support Area (KPW) has stalled and has not been resumed, despite the site plan designating essential facilities such as street vendor kiosks, accommodation, parking, and a performing arts venue. As a result, several infrastructure facilities are unused and the area appears poorly maintained. These limited supporting facilities reduce the area's capacity as an integrated tourist destination and impact the image of Banten Lama. Furthermore the concentration of visitors at the Grand Mosque of Banten has led to a decline in interest in the Tourism Support Area, leading to its suboptimal utilization.

Weak enforcement of regulations is also evident at Spelwijk Fort. Despite a ban on playing soccer in accordance with Law Number 11 of 2010 concerning Cultural Heritage, such activities continue to occur within the cultural heritage site. This situation indicates that oversight and enforcement of regulations are suboptimal, potentially threatening the site's sustainability. This phenomenon reflects a gap between the revitalization goals and their implementation on the ground. The effectiveness of revitalization is measured not only by physical changes, but also by the success in maintaining the site's function and increasing public awareness and compliance with area regulations.

Based on initial observations, there is a gap between the revitalization goals, which aim to create a more organized area, and the conditions on the ground, which still indicate community resistance to the policy. This gap reflects the difference between revitalization planning and implementation. The effectiveness of revitalization is measured not only by the physical changes achieved, but also by the extent to which the policy accommodates the interests of local communities, such as vendors, without neglecting the program's primary objectives.

Given the historical significance and potential of the Banten Lama Area, revitalization is a strategic step in preserving the area and strengthening its social, cultural, and economic functions. The revitalization program aims not only to restore the area's physical condition but also to increase its tourist appeal and support community economic activities. Based on this background, this study focuses on analyzing the effectiveness of the revitalization of the Banten Lama Area. This study aims to assess the extent to which the revitalization has achieved its stated objectives and to identify various factors and obstacles that influence its implementation.

RESEARCH METHODS

This study uses a qualitative approach to analyze the effectiveness of the revitalization of the Banten Lama area. The research location focused on priority revitalization areas in Serang City, including the Kaibon Palace, Surosowan Fort, the Grand Mosque of Banten, Spelwijk Fort, the Tourism Support Area (KPW), and the Sukadiri Terminal. These

locations were chosen because of their high historical and religious value and because they serve as the center of the revitalization program.

The research informants consisted of 17 people selected through purposive sampling based on their direct involvement in the revitalization program and as affected parties. The informants consisted of government and area managers, namely four people from the Regional Cultural Preservation Center VIII (BPKW 8), including one cultural heritage expert and three site caretakers in the field. In addition, one person each came from the Public Works and Spatial Planning Agency (PUPR) of Banten Province, the Regional Development Planning Agency (BAPPEDA) of Banten Province, the Tourism Office of Banten Province, the Regional Development Planning Agency (BAPPEDA) of Serang City, the Transportation Agency (DISHUB) of Serang City, the Banten Task Force, and the Kenadziran of the Banten Sultanate. This study also involved six people from the revitalization target group, consisting of three tourists and three vendors in the Banten Lama Area.

Data collection was conducted through semi structured interviews, field observations, and documentation studies. This study utilized Nakamura and Smallwood's theoretical framework for policy effectiveness, which consists of five indicators: Achievement of program objectives, efficiency, target group satisfaction, client responsiveness, and maintenance systems. The data obtained were then categorized based on these five indicators and analyzed to illustrate the effectiveness of the revitalization of the Banten Lama area based on field findings.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Achievement of Program Objectives

The achievement of program objectives in the revitalization of the Banten Lama area represents the extent to which government formulated policies can be implemented in the field. Revitalization objectives include reorganizing historical areas, improving infrastructure, enhancing visitor comfort, and strengthening the function of religious tourism. Therefore, effectiveness in this dimension is measured not only by the physical changes as program outputs, but also by the alignment between normative objectives and resulting outcomes.

Assessment of the achievement of objectives was obtained through interviews with various informants, namely BPKW 8, PUPR Banten Province, Bappeda Banten Province, Banten Province Tourism Office, Bappeda Serang City, Dishub Serang City, Banten Task Force, Kenadziran, tourists, and vendors. Questions focused on understanding the objectives of the revitalization, indicators of success, realization of objectives in the field, and benefits felt after the revitalization was implemented.

The research results show that the physical revitalization has resulted in significant changes, particularly in core areas such as the Grand Mosque of Banten, Surosowan Palace, Kaibon Palace, and Speelwijk Fortress. Previously unorganized areas are now more open, clean, and have better accessibility. Pedestrian planning, the demolition of illegal buildings, improved lighting, and the addition of physical elements to the area have had a positive impact on visual comfort and visitor experience. In terms of physical output, the revitalization goals can be said to be relatively achieved.

However, in policy implementation the objectives of revitalization are not uniformly understood by the

implementing actors. Each agency interprets revitalization based on its respective core duties and functions. BPKW 8 emphasizes the protection and transparency of cultural heritage sites, PUPR emphasizes infrastructure improvements, the Banten Province BAPPEDA views it as part of regional development priorities and the security of state assets, the Tourism Office assesses success through increased visits, while the Serang City BAPPEDA focuses more on the social and economic impacts on the community.

These differing views indicate that the revitalization objectives are not uniform and are not formulated within an integrated, cross sectoral operational framework. The lack of mutually agreed upon success indicators leads to sectoral evaluation of the program. Success is assessed based on the achievements of individual agencies, rather than on the achievement of overall regional objectives. This situation indicates a weakness in the policy formulation stage, where the established objectives are not translated into measurable performance indicators that can serve as a shared reference.

The dominance of a physical approach in implementation suggests that revitalization is understood more as a spatial planning project than as a sustainable area management policy. The focus on sterilizing the core zone, installing fences, using new materials, and enhancing the area's aesthetics has indeed improved its visual image and tourist appeal. However this approach also has consequences for the social and historical function of public spaces, particularly in the area of the Banten Grand Mosque square.

According to Government Regulation No. 1 of 2022 concerning Cultural Heritage, revitalization should revitalize the significance of cultural heritage while still considering its social function and the cultural values of the community. Research findings indicate that several policies restricting access and changing the material of public spaces actually limit the town square's function as an open social space. This indicates that the restoration of historical and social values has not been fully realized, despite improvements in the area's aesthetics.

Furthermore, the lack of a unified management body is a structural factor hindering the comprehensive achievement of objectives. The division of authority between provincial and city governments results in the area's management not being integrated within a single, coherent system. Implementation proceeds according to respective authorities, but without long-term management integration. Policy wise, this situation demonstrates weak institutional coordination during the implementation phase.

The impact is evident in the suboptimal arrangement of vendors and the utilization of the Tourism Support Area (KPW). The KPW designed as a solution for vendor relocation, has not functioned effectively due to the lack of visitor flow management and parking system integration. Parking remains concentrated around the mosque, preventing visitor flow from passing through the KPW, thus discouraging vendors from moving. The return of vendors to the core zone demonstrates that the socio economic goals of revitalization have not been achieved sustainably. This situation indicates a mismatch between policy design and the region's socio economic dynamics.

From Nakamura and Smallwood's perspective, program effectiveness in terms of goal achievement indicators is determined by the extent to which the stated goals can be realized and truly felt by the community. Research findings indicate that the revitalization of Banten Lama has been

successful in terms of physical outputs, such as infrastructure improvements and area planning, but has not yet fully produced social and economic impacts that can be felt evenly by the community. Thus, the achievement of the program's goals is still partial.

Furthermore, within the theoretical framework of implementation ambiguity and the Matland conflict model (Muhaling, 2025), unclear operational objectives and differing interpretations between agencies reflect policy ambiguity. When objectives are not explicitly formulated in cross sectoral indicators, implementation tends to be sectoral and non-collaborative. As a result, revitalization outcomes reflect institutional priorities rather than comprehensive regional objectives.

Based on these findings, the achievement of the revitalization goals of the Banten Lama area cannot be said to be optimal. While the physical changes to the area have shown quite good results, the social and economic benefits and the strengthening of the area's historical function have not yet been fully felt by the community. Within Nakamura and Smallwood's framework, this situation indicates limited effectiveness, namely measurable technical success, but less than optimal social change and sustainability.

Efficiency

Efficiency in the revitalization of the Banten Lama area assesses the extent to which budgetary resources, manpower, time, and institutional coordination are optimally utilized to produce outputs commensurate with program objectives. From Nakamura and Smallwood's perspective, efficiency relates to the balance between costs incurred and program implementation, as well as the quality of results achieved within the timeframe and available resources.

Optimizing resource utilization demonstrates that the revitalization of the Banten Lama Area demonstrates a well-planned use of resources, despite limitations. In terms of experts BPKW 8 involves maintenance personnel with expertise in cultural heritage preservation, while PUPR is supported by a task force comprising mechanics, cleaning staff, and security personnel, as well as certified technical consultants. Coordination between provincial and city government agencies has been regulated through a memorandum of understanding (MoU) that divides roles and responsibilities during the planning stage.

However efficiency has not been fully achieved because the revitalization results have not been optimally utilized. Several supporting facilities, such as kiosks in the Tourism Support Area (KPW), the Sukadiri Terminal and several spaces in the Banten Islamic Center, are not yet functioning as originally intended. Tourist activity remains concentrated in the core zone, while supporting facilities are underutilized due to the lack of integrated visitor flow management and direction. This situation indicates that the physical development has not yet produced adequate benefits compared to the resources expended.

Inefficiencies were also evident in the initial planning stage, which employed a design and build scheme without adequate cultural heritage and spatial planning studies. The failure to involve the regional cultural preservation center (BPKW) 8 from the outset resulted in several physical projects requiring revisions or readjustments. This situation reflects a waste of time and resources that could have been minimized through more comprehensive technical planning. Within the framework of policy implementation, weaknesses

in the initial formulation stage constitute a source of structural inefficiencies because they impact the quality of the process and its outcomes on an ongoing basis.

Budget constraints also influence policy orientation. The government prioritizes basic maintenance over comprehensive development of area functions. Efficiency is then understood as the ability to maintain the sustainability of facilities with limited resources, rather than optimizing the area's benefits. Consequently revitalization achievements are unevenly distributed between core and supporting zones.

In addition to technical factors the institutional structure divided between the provincial government, city government, BPKW 8, and other agencies reinforces sectoral efficiency patterns. The absence of a unified management body prevents physical development and economic utilization of the area from running smoothly. For example, the construction of KPW kiosks was not accompanied by regulations on visitor flow or economic incentives for vendors, resulting in ineffective relocations, resulting in vendors returning to the core zone. From Nakamura and Smallwood's perspective, efficiency is assessed by the alignment of costs, time, and resources used with the quality of program implementation. Research findings indicate that suboptimal coordination impacts implementation quality, resulting in some activities not proceeding as originally planned.

Overall, the revitalization of the Banten Lama area demonstrates less than optimal efficiency. Some operational aspects are proceeding according to procedures, but there is a discrepancy between the resources used and the results achieved, particularly in facility utilization and area management. This situation indicates that the use of funds and resources has not yet fully achieved the program's optimal quality.

Target Group Satisfaction

Target group satisfaction indicates the extent to which the revitalization of the Banten Lama area meets the needs and expectations of those directly affected, particularly tourists and vendors. Based on the theory of Nakamura and Smallwood (Syativa, 2022), a program is considered effective if the target group feels their needs are met and they receive tangible benefits from its implementation. Therefore, tourist and vendor satisfaction is a key indicator for assessing the success of revitalization.

The research findings indicate a significant difference in satisfaction between groups. Tourists were generally satisfied with the revitalization results, particularly regarding cleanliness, comfort, spatial order, and aesthetic enhancements to core areas such as the Grand Mosque and the plaza. Pedestrian management, restrictions on large vehicles, and improvements to basic facilities were considered to enhance the quality of the visitor experience. This satisfaction is direct and visual, making the physical changes to the area easily interpreted as a sign of successful revitalization.

Tourist satisfaction tends to be concentrated in the core zone. The lack of integration between the core zone and supporting zones prevents this satisfaction from promoting equitable distribution of benefits within the area. Tourists remain satisfied even when facilities such as KPW are suboptimal, as visiting patterns are not directed toward comprehensive exploration of the area. This situation suggests that tourist satisfaction reflects short term physical success rather than the area's integrated effectiveness.

In contrast vendors reported lower satisfaction. The rezoning of the area restricted trading space to strategic locations and altered the patterns of economic interaction that previously supported their income. Relocation to less strategic areas and the misalignment of visitor flow with kiosk locations led to a decline in revenue. For vendors, satisfaction is not determined by physical tidiness, but by the sustainability of income and the security of business space. When these economic needs are not met, revitalization is not perceived as a beneficial policy.

This difference in satisfaction indicates that revitalization is more responsive to the needs of visitors as temporary users than to the needs of vendors as daily economic actors. Policy wise, this situation demonstrates an imbalance in program orientation, emphasizing aesthetics and tourism over local economic sustainability. Without integrating economic strategies into the design of the area, revitalization has the potential to improve the area's image while weakening its socio economic status.

From Nakamura and Smallwood's perspective, this situation reflects limited effectiveness. The program successfully met the needs of one target group, but failed to fully accommodate the interests of others. Comprehensive effectiveness can only be achieved if spatial planning policies are accompanied by visitor flow management, support for vendor operational facilities, and clear communication mechanisms regarding permitted business spaces. Therefore, increasing tourist satisfaction needs to be balanced with policies that ensure the economic sustainability of vendors so that revitalization proceeds in a balanced manner and does not create unequal benefits between target groups.

Client Responsiveness

According to Nakamura and Smallwood (Syativa, 2022), client responsiveness indicates the extent to which target groups respond to, accept, and participate in the implementation and sustainability of a policy. In the context of the revitalization of the Banten Lama Area the clients in question include the Kenadziran of the Banten Sultanate and the Banten Task Force. This indicator is crucial for assessing whether the changes resulting from the program are truly understood, accepted, and maintained by area users.

The research results indicate that client responsiveness is not comprehensive and is uneven at each policy stage. At the development stage, the public generally receives only one way information without adequate space for dialogue. Although some academics and community leaders are involved in the planning stage, this involvement is limited and does not reflect participation that represents the broader community. As a result, the majority of the community is not directly involved in the planning process or program implementation. This situation indicates that the space for public participation remains selective and does not reach a wide range of target groups.

In contrast, community participation is more visible in the operational and maintenance phases. The recruitment of local residents into the cleaning and security task force demonstrates a functional response. The community is involved in waste management, monitoring tourist activities, and maintaining order in the area. The difference in participation patterns is clearly visible in the Banten Grand Mosque area. Through coordination with the Kenadziran of the Banten Sultanate, the community is involved in cleaning, security and order activities based on mutual cooperation. The

Kenadziran's socio cultural legitimacy and emotional closeness to the community encourage more consistent participation compared to other areas that are solely managed administratively by the government. This situation indicates that the presence of a culturally based local authority has a significant influence on the level of community responsiveness.

The participation that occurs is still predominantly operational, rather than substantive, in decision making. The lack of structured public consultation mechanisms leaves communities without a formal channel to express their concerns during the planning stage. As a result, some physical interventions are potentially less aligned with local socio cultural needs. This can diminish a sense of ownership and undermine long-term sustainability.

The impact on the effectiveness of revitalization is significant. Revitalization supported solely by administrative structures without strengthening social systems risks producing physical success that is not fully sustainable. While the presence of the Task Force and the practice of mutual cooperation have positively contributed to regional stability, there is no systematically integrated participatory policy. Efforts to increase participation still rely on moral appeals and individual awareness, rather than strong institutional design.

Thus from Nakamura and Smallwood's perspective, client responsiveness in the revitalization of the Banten Lama area has shown limited success. The target group generally accepts the policy and participates in its maintenance, but their involvement in the planning and decision-making processes remains minimal. This situation indicates that acceptance of the policy has been established, but active participation has not yet developed widely. Therefore, strengthening community engagement mechanisms is necessary to ensure the sustainability of the area.

Maintenance System

The maintenance system is an indicator that assesses the desired revitalization outcomes after the implementation phase is complete. From Nakamura and Smallwood's perspective, good maintenance ensures the program doesn't stop at its initial achievements but continues sustainably. Therefore, the maintenance system in the revitalization of the Banten Lama area is assessed based on the clarity of division of responsibilities, coordination between agencies, regular implementation of operational standards, and the ability to respond to emerging issues in the field.

Research findings indicate that maintenance in the Banten Lama area has been ongoing, but it is sectoral and fragmented. BPKW 8 manages the core cultural heritage zone through a caretaker, PUPR manages the park, mosque plaza, and public infrastructure, Kenadziran Banten Sultanate's is responsible for the Banten Grand Mosque and the Banten Task Force handles daily cleanliness and security. This division operates according to formal authority, but is not integrated into a single management system.

This institutional division results in unequal standards, maintenance frequency, and response speed across zones. At cultural heritage sites, strict conservation procedures require tiered reporting before repairs are undertaken. In principle, this mechanism is essential for maintaining the building's authenticity. However operationally, the hierarchical process slows down the handling of minor damage, potentially increasing the risk of further damage. This demonstrates a

tension between the principle of protecting authenticity and the need for rapid response, which impacts maintenance effectiveness.

From a human resources perspective, the lack of recruitment of new maintenance personnel has led to a reliance on contract workers and third parties. This situation has the potential to impact the consistency of long-term maintenance quality. Meanwhile, public infrastructure maintenance is relatively stable due to the support of routine regional budget (APBD) funding and formal standard operating procedures (SOP). Facilities such as street lighting, parks, and area cleanliness can still be regularly maintained.

External pressures also impact the system's sustainability. High visitor activity, vandalism, and the return of some vendors to the plaza area increase the maintenance burden. In this context, system effectiveness is determined not only by institutional design but also by the behavior of area users. When oversight is limited and social participation is suboptimal, facility deterioration tends to occur more quickly.

User perceptions varied. Tourists generally considered the area to be in good condition, as their experience was temporary and limited to a specific area. Conversely, managers and vendors were more aware of a decline in quality in several areas. This variation indicates that the area is visually well-maintained, but structurally, there are vulnerabilities in its continued maintenance.

From Nakamura and Smallwood's perspective, the maintenance system in the Banten Lama area can be categorized as working but not yet optimally effective. The program's sustainability still relies on the division of authority between agencies, rather than on comprehensive system integration. Disparities in standards, slow response times in certain zones, and pressures on land use indicate that the revitalization results are not fully supported by a robust and integrated maintenance mechanism. Thus the effectiveness of revitalization based on maintenance system indicators is limited. Strengthening cross agency coordination, standardizing procedures, and integrating management and social aspects are prerequisites for consistently maintaining revitalization benefits over the long term.

CONCLUSION

The revitalization of the Banten Lama area has successfully improved the physical condition of the area and enhanced environmental quality, particularly in the core zone of the historic area. In terms of achieving program objectives, the revitalization is considered effective in physical aspects, but has not fully achieved the social and economic goals and the comprehensive restoration of the function of historic spaces. The revitalization's effectiveness is still limited by weak integration between institutions, suboptimal utilization of supporting facilities, and differences in satisfaction levels among target groups. Tourists tend to benefit from the revitalization, while merchants have not yet experienced a sustainable economic impact. A client response and maintenance system has been implemented, but remains sectoral and lacks strong cross institutional coordination. The challenge of revitalization lies not in physical development, but rather in weak governance after revitalization. Therefore, it is necessary to establish a cross agency coordination forum led by a single agency or management body with a clear mandate, accompanied by shared performance indicators, quarterly evaluation meetings, and a formal follow up

mechanism. Without a strengthened, operational and binding coordination structure, area management will remain sectoral, resulting in inconsistent maintenance standards and the potential for supporting facilities to be neglected again. On the other hand, the disparity in benefits between tourists and vendors indicates that the revitalization approach still tends to be top-down. Therefore, community participation, particularly vendors, needs to be institutionalized through representative forums and joint design mechanisms for economic spatial planning and the evaluation of relocation policies. This participatory, dialogue based engagement is crucial to ensure that policies are not merely administrative but also responsive to local socio economic conditions, thereby reducing the recurrence of informal practices. Furthermore, audits of the reuse of abandoned kiosks and stalled KPW must be systematically conducted by relevant agencies, along with a measurable reactivation plan. Without data driven evaluation and clear follow up, revitalization budgets risk not generating sustainable economic impact. Therefore, strengthening institutional coordination, institutionalizing community participation, and monitoring facility utilization are prerequisites for achieving effective revitalization that is not only physically successful but also socially and economically equitable and sustainable.

REFERENCE

- Andari, M., & Zulkarnaini, Z. (2022). Efektivitas Pemanfaatan Aset Daerah Bidang Pertanian di Kabupaten Indragiri Hulu. *Jurnal Ilmiah Wahana Pendidikan*, 8(17), 253-265.
- Budiani, N.W. (2009). Efektivitas Program Penanggulangan Pengangguran Karang taruna "Eka Taruna Bhakti" Desa Sumerta Kelod Kecamatan Denpasar Timur Kota Denpasar. *Jurnal Ekonomi Sosial*, 2(1), 49-57. <https://ojs.unud.ac.id/index.php/input/article/view/3191>
- Gubernur Banten. (2018). Keputusan Gubernur Banten Nomor 437/Kep.160- Huk/2018 Tentang Penetapan Zonasi Kawasan Cagar Budaya Kesultanan Banten (Banten Lama).
- Irma, Y. A., & Zulkarnaini, Z. (2022). Efektivitas Pelayanan Publik Pada Layanan Oke Masyarakat Keliling (Lomak) di Kecamatan Rumbai Barat Kota Pekanbaru. *Jurnal Ilmiah Wahana Pendidikan*, 8(22), 530-539.
- Juliadi., Soni. P.W., Bayu. A., Pahlawan. P.S.N., Mimi. L. (2015). Ragam Pusaka Budaya Banten. Dinas Kebudayaan dan Pariwisata Provinsi Banten.
- Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan, Direktorat Jenderal Kebudayaan, Direktorat Pelestarian Cagar Budaya dan Permuseuman (2023). Pedoman Revitalisasi Cagar Budaya.
- Kowass. A.S., Novie. P., Neni. K. (2017). Efektivitas Pelaksanaan Tomohon International Flower Festival di Kota Tomohon. *Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan*, 2 (2), 1-11. <https://ejournal.unsrat.ac.id/v2/index.php/jurnaleksektif/article/view/18363>
- Kota Serang. (2011). Peraturan Daerah Kota Serang Nomor 6 Tahun 2011 tentang Rencana Tata Ruang Wilayah Kota Serang Tahun 2010-2030.
- Lestari. A.A., Ahmad. S., Rethorik. B. (2021). Pengaruh Revitalisasi Kawasan Banten Lama Terhadap Tingkat Kunjungan Wisatawan Kawasan Religi Keraton Kesultanan Banten di Kecamatan Kasemen Kota Serang. *Jurnal Ilmu Politik dan Pemerintahan*, 1-13. <https://doi.org/10.37058/jipp.v7i1.2242>

- Menteri PUPR. (2010). Peraturan Menteri Pekerjaan Umum Nomor: 18/PRT/M/2010 Tentang Pedoman Revitalisasi Kawasan.
- Muhaling, T.T., Agus, S., Muhammad, R.B. (2025). Konflik dan Ambiguitas Implementasi Peraturan Bupati Sidoarjo Nomor 84 Tahun 2017 tentang Penataan dan Pemberdayaan Pedagang Kaki Lima. *Jurnal Ilmu Hukum, Administrasi Publik dan Ilmu Komunikasi*. 2 (3), 92-101. <https://doi.org/10.62383/konstitusi.v2i3.803>
- Provinsi Banten. (2017). Peraturan Daerah Provinsi Banten Nomor 7 tahun 2017 tentang Rencana Pembangunan Jangka Menengah Daerah Provinsi Banten tahun 2017-2022.
- Pirdaus. T. (2023). Kebijakan Pemerintah Provinsi Banten Terhadap Pengembangan Wisata Religi Di Kabupaten Serang. (1), 241-246. <https://doi.org/10.30656/senaskah.v1i1.30>
- Pritawati. R., Kurnia. N.F. (2024). Dampak Revitalisasi Kawasan Malioboro Terhadap PKL Dalam Pengembangan Pariwisata Berbasis Budaya di Kota Yogyakarta. *Journal of Public Policy And Administration Research*. 09 (1). <https://journal.student.uny.ac.id/index.php/joppar>
- Ramadhani. A., Ismail. (2019). Efektivitas Penanganan Kawasan Permukiman Kumuh Di Kecamatan Tamalate Kota Makassar. *Jurnal Ilmu Administrasi Publik*, 8 (2). <https://ojs.unm.ac.id/birokrat/article/view/19615>
- Rahayu. N.R., Yeyet. S., Evi. P. (2021). Efektivitas Dinas Tata Ruang dan Permukiman Dalam Program Rehabilitasi Rumah Tidak Layak Huni Kabupaten Purwakarta. *Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Administrasi Negara*. 08 (1), 77 -90. <https://jurnal.unigal.ac.id/dinamika/article/view/4460>
- Ridwan, I., dkk. (2021). Studi Kebantenan Dalam Catatan Sejarah. *Media Edukasi Indonesia*: Tangerang.
- Sonaesti. C., Edi. P. (2022). Revitalisasi Kawasan Kota Lama Semarang: Antara Harapan Dan Kenyataan. *Jurnal Arsitektur*, 21-29. <https://e-journal.ukri.ac.id/index.php/arcade/article/view/813>
- Suni. M.T., Dedy. H. (2019). Efektivitas Peranan Pemerintah Daerah Dalam Merevitalisasi Potensi Objek Wisata di Kabupaten Jeneponto. *Journal of Tourism, Hospitality, Travel dan Business Event*. 1 (1) 14 – 17. <https://doi.org/10.33649/pusaka.v1i1.8>
- Sutmasa. Y. G. (2021). Memastikan Efektivitas Implementasi Kebijakan Publik. *Jurnal Cakrawarti*, 4 (1) 25 – 36. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/350974171_Memastikan_Efektivitas_Implementasi_Kebijakan_Publik
- Syakira, A., & Zulkarnaini, Z. (2025). Efektivitas Pengembangan Program Ekoeduwisata Mangrove di Desa Pangkalan Jambi Kecamatan Bukit Batu Kabupaten Bengkalis. *Innovative: Journal Of Social Science Research*, 5(1), 2358-2367.
- Tamrin, L., & Zulkarnaini, Z. (2023). Efektifitas Kerja Pegawai Dinas Sosial Dalam Verifikasi Dan Validasi Data Penerima Dana Bantuan Sosial Di Kota Pekanbaru. *Diklat Review: Jurnal manajemen pendidikan dan pelatihan*, 7(1), 177-182.